Borel-reducibility counterparts of Shelah's classification theory

Miguel Moreno
University of Vienna
FWF Meitner-Programm

Seminario Mundo - Lógica - Modelos
Bogota

3 Octubre, 2023

Geometry

- Independence of Euclid's fifth postulate, the parallel postulate.
- Khayyám (1077) and Saccheri (1733) considered the three different cases of the Khayyám-Saccheri quadrilateral (right, obtuse, and acute).
- Euclidean geometry, Elliptic geometry, Hyperbolic geometry.

The spectrum fuction

Let T be a countable theory over a countable language. Let $I(T,\alpha)$ denote the number of non-isomorphic models of T with cardinality α.

What is the behavior of $I(T,\alpha)$?

Categoricity

- **1904:** Veble introduced categorical theories.
- **1915 - 1920:** Löwenheim-Skolem Theorem.
- **1929:** Gödel's completeness theorem.
- **1954:** Łoś and Vaught introduced κ-categorical theories.
- **1965:** Morley's categoricity theorem.

Morley's conjecture

1960's: Let T be a first-order countable theory over a countable language. For all $\aleph_0 < \lambda < \kappa$,

$$I(T,\lambda) \leq I(T,\kappa).$$

1990: Shelah proved Morley's conjecture.

Shelah's Main Gap Theorem

Theorem (Shelah 1990)

Either, for every uncountable cardinal α, $I(T,\alpha)=2^\alpha$; or $\forall\alpha>0$, $I(T,\aleph_\alpha)<\beth_{\omega_1}(|\alpha|)$.

If T is classifiable and T' is not, then T is less complex than T' and their complexity are not close.

Descriptive Set Theory

- **1989:** Friedman and Stanley introduced the Borel reducibility between classes of countable structures.
- **1993:** Mekler-Väänänen κ-separation theorem.
- **2014:** Friedman-Hyttinen-Kulikov developed GDST and a systematic comparison between the Main Gap dividing lines and the complexity given by Borel reducibility.

The bounded topology

Let κ be an uncountable cardinal that satisfies $\kappa^{<\kappa} = \kappa$.

We equip the set κ^κ with the bounded topology. For every $\zeta \in \kappa^{<\kappa}$, the set

$$[\zeta] = \{\eta \in \kappa^\kappa \mid \zeta \subset \eta\}$$

is a basic open set.

The Generalised Baire spaces

The generalised Baire space is the space κ^κ endowed with the bounded topology.

The generalised Cantor space is the subspace 2^κ.

Coding structures

Let $\omega \leq \mu \leq \kappa$ be a cardinal. Fix a relational language $\mathcal{L} = \{P_n | n < \omega\}$ and a bijection π_μ between $\mu^{<\omega}$ and μ.

Definition

For every $\eta \in \kappa^\kappa$ define the structure $\mathcal{A}_{\eta\restriction\mu}$ with domain μ as follows: For every tuple $(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n)$ in μ^n

$$(a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n) \in P_m^{\mathcal{A}_{\eta\restriction\mu}} \Leftrightarrow \eta(\pi_\mu(m, a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n)) > 0.$$

The isomorphism relation

Definition

Let $\omega \leq \mu \leq \kappa$ be a cardinal and T a first-order theory in a relational countable language, we say that $f, g \in \kappa^\kappa$ are $\cong_T^\mu$ equivalent if one of the following holds:

- $\mathcal{A}_{\eta\restriction\mu} \models T, \mathcal{A}_{\xi\restriction\mu} \models T, \mathcal{A}_{\eta\restriction\mu} \cong \mathcal{A}_{\xi\restriction\mu}$
- $\mathcal{A}_{\eta\restriction\mu} \not\models T, \mathcal{A}_{\xi\restriction\mu} \not\models T$

Reductions

Let E_1 and E_2 be equivalence relations on κ^κ. We say that E_1 is *reducible* to E_2, if there is a function $f\colon \kappa^\kappa \to \kappa^\kappa$ that satisfies $(x,y) \in E_1 \Leftrightarrow (f(x), f(y)) \in E_2$. We write $E_1 \hookrightarrow_r E_2$.

We can define a partial order on the set of all first-order complete countable theories

$$T \leq^\kappa T' \textit{ iff } \cong_T \hookrightarrow_C \cong_{T'}$$

Non-classifiable theories

A theory T is non-classifiable if it is a countable complete theory that satisfies one of the following:

- T is unstable;
- T is stable unsuperstable;
- T is superstable with DOP; %pause
- T is superstable with OTOP.

Classifiable theories

Classifiable are divided into:

- shallow,

$$I(T,\aleph_\alpha) < \beth_{\omega_1}(|\alpha|);$$

- non-shallow,

$$I(T,\alpha) = 2^\alpha.$$

First dividing lines

Fact (Friedman-Hyttinen-Kulikov 2014)

1. *Let $\kappa^{<\kappa} = \kappa > 2^\omega$. If T is classifiable and shallow, then $\cong_T$ is κ-Borel.*
2. *If T is classifiable non-shallow, then $\cong_T$ is $\Delta_1^1(\kappa)$ not κ-Borel.*
3. *If T is unstable or stable with the OTOP or superstable with the DOP and $\kappa > \omega_1$, then $\cong_T$ is not $\Delta_1^1(\kappa)$.*
4. *If T is stable unsuperstable, then $\cong_T$ is not κ-Borel.*

Question

Question: What can we say about the Borel-reducibility between different dividing lines?

Classifiable and shallow

Theorem (Mangraviti - Motto Ros 2020)

Let κ be such that $\kappa > 2^\omega$. If T is classifiable and shallow with depth α, then $rk_B(\cong_T) \leq 4\alpha$.

Theorem (Mangraviti - Motto Ros 2020)

Let $\kappa = \aleph_\gamma$ be such that $\kappa^{<\kappa} = \kappa$ and $\beth_{\omega_1}(|\gamma|) \leq \kappa$. Let T, T' be countable complete first-order theories, and suppose T is classifiable and shallow, while T' is not. Then

$$\cong_T \hookrightarrow_B \cong_{T'}$$

General reduction

Fact (Mangraviti-Motto Ros)

Let E_1 be a Borel equivalence relation with $\gamma \leq \kappa$ equivalence classes and E_2 be an equivalence relation with θ equivalence classes. If $\gamma \leq \theta$, then $E_1 \hookrightarrow_B E_2$.

1_ϱ relation

Let $0 < \varrho \leq \kappa$. $\eta\ 1_\varrho\ \xi$ if and only if one of the following holds:

- ϱ is finite:
  - $\eta(0) = \xi(0) < \varrho - 1$;
  - $\eta(0), \xi(0) \geq \varrho - 1$.
- ϱ is infinite:
  - $\eta(0) = \xi(0) < \varrho$;
  - $\eta(0), \xi(0) \geq \varrho$.

Few equivalence classes

Lemma (M. 2023)

Suppose $\kappa > 2^\omega$ and T is a countable first-order theory in a countable vocabulary (not necessarily complete) such that $\cong_T$ has $\varrho \leq \kappa$ equivalence classes. Then

$$\cong_T \hookrightarrow_B 1_\varrho \text{ and } 1_\varrho \hookrightarrow_L \cong_T .$$

Even more, if T is not categorical then $\cong_T \not\hookrightarrow_C 1_\varrho$.

Proof

- $\cong_T \hookrightarrow_B 1_\varrho$ follows from Mangraviti-Motto Ros.
- $\eta \restriction 1$ determines the equivalence class of η. So $1_\varrho \hookrightarrow_L \cong_T$.
- 1_ϱ is open, so $\cong_T \hookrightarrow_C 1_\varrho$ implies $\cong_T$ is open.
- $\cong_T$ is open iff T is categorical (Mangraviti-Motto Ros), so if T is not categorical then $\cong_T \not\hookrightarrow_C 1_\varrho$.

Gap: Shallow and Non-shallow

Theorem (M. 2023)

Suppose $\aleph_\mu = \kappa = \lambda^+ = 2^\lambda$ *is such that* $\beth_{\omega_1}(|\mu|) \leq \kappa$. *Let* T_1 *be a countable complete classifiable shallow theory with* $\varrho = I(\kappa, T_1)$, T_2 *be a countable complete theory not classifiable shallow. If* T *is classifiable shallow such that* $1 < I(\kappa, T) < I(\kappa, T_1)$, *then*

$$\cong_T \hookrightarrow_B 1_\varrho \hookrightarrow_L \cong_{T_1} \hookrightarrow_B 1_\kappa \hookrightarrow_L \cong_{T_2} .$$

In particular

$$\cong_{T_2} \not\hookrightarrow_r 1_\kappa \not\hookrightarrow_r \cong_{T_1} \not\hookrightarrow_C 1_\varrho \not\hookrightarrow_r \cong_T .$$

Thank you

Article at: https://arxiv.org/abs/2308.07510

References

- O. Veblen, *A System of Axioms for Geometry*, Transactions of the American Mathematical Society **5**, 343–384 (1904).
- L. Löwenheim, *Über Möglichkeiten im Relativkalkül*, Math. Ann. **76**, 447–470 (1915).
- T. Skolem, *Logisch-kombinatorische Untersuchungen über die Erfüllbarkeit oder Beweisbarkeit mathematischer Sätze nebst einem Theoreme über dichte Mengen*, Videnskapsselskapets skrifter. I. Mat.-naturv. klasse. **4**, 1–36 (1920).
- K. Gödel, *Über die Vollständigkeit des Logikkalküls*, Ph.D. thesis. University Of Vienna. (Vienna, 1929).
- J. Łoś, *On the categoricity in power of elementary deductive systems*, Colloq. Math. **3**, 58–62 (1954).

References

- M. Morley, *Categoricity in power*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **114**, 514–538 (1965).
- S. Shelah, *Classification theory*, Stud. Logic Found. Math. **92**, North-Holland (1990).
- H. Friedman, L. Stanley, *A Borel reducibility theory for classes of countable structures*, Journal of Symbolic Logic. **54**, 894–914 (1989).
- A. Mekler, and J. Väänänen, *Trees and Π^1_1-subsets of ${}^{\omega}_{1}\omega_1$*, The Journal of Symbolic Logic. **58**, 1052–1070 (1993).
- S.D. Friedman, T. Hyttinen, and V. Kulikov, *Generalized descriptive set theory and classification theory*, in Memories of the American Mathematical Society **230** (2014).

References

- F. Mangraviti, and L. Motto Ros, *A descriptive main gap theorem*, Journal of Mathematical Logic. **21**, 2050025 (2020).
- M. Moreno, *Shelah's Main Gap and the generalized Borel-reducibility*. Preprint, (2023).